

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, MARCH 14, 2005

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Senhauser, Bloomfield, Raser, Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger, and Wallace present. Absent: Chatterjee, Kirk, and Kreider.

MINUTES

The Board unanimously approved the minutes of the Monday, February 28, 2005 meeting (motion by Sullebarger, second by Bloomfield).

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 335 TUSCULUM AVENUE, COLUMBIA TUSCULUM HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented a staff report on a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new addition on the rear elevation of 335 Tusculum Avenue. Staff stated that the proposed work and materials met the conservation guidelines and reflected earlier recommendations the Board made during a preliminary design review on November 8, 2005. The new addition will not be visible from the public right-of-way. It will not overpower the existing residence or result in the loss of or damage to significant architectural features.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Bloomfield, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed addition with the condition that final drawings and specifications be submitted to the Urban Conservator for review and approval prior to construction.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 927 RACE STREET, COURT STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

Urban Conservator William Forwood presented the staff report for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 927 Race Street. On July 31, 2003, staff approved an application for a building permit to replace the existing windows on the condition that the new units fit within the original openings without modification, as described in the application. Instead, full size one-over-one and two-over-two double-hung sash were replaced with shortened sash windows over air conditioner sleeves in 18 of the 54 openings in the front, side and rear elevations. Staff learned of the work when the local building inspector questioned whether the new work conformed to the approved permit.

The Court Street Historic District Guidelines state that original window openings should not be altered and window replacements should match the character of the original. The installation of utility systems should be avoided on the street façade.

The owner, Howard Sharon, and his architect, David Thiel of Brashear Bolton Inc., appeared to request relief from the district guidelines and to explain why the work was performed at variance with the approved permit set. Mr. Sharon said that he could have installed full-size windows and inserted air conditioners within the frame, but thought that a shortened window with a permanently installed air conditioner was preferable and would avoid the inconvenience of seasonally removing the air conditioners. He indicated that modifying the completed work would be costly but acknowledged that he would not have incurred that expense if he had conformed to the approved plans.

The Board expressed concern that the air conditioners would be permanent on the street facades and that the sash bars on the shorter windows do not align with those on the full-size replacements. The Board discussed other solutions with the applicant; but the majority felt the completed work was unacceptable and concluded that there was no feasible compromise to be reached.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Sullebarger) to take the following actions:

1. Deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the shortened window installations in the 18 locations.
2. Require the applicant to follow the original building permit approval and install one-over-one windows that fit the original openings in those 18 locations.

**NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION, GENERAL HOSPITAL NURSES' HOME /
LOGAN HALL, CENTRAL CLINIC, 311 ALBERT SABIN WAY**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented a National Register nomination prepared by Bruce E. Goetzman to list the General Hospital Nurses' Home / Logan Hall, Central Clinic in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). The City of Cincinnati was asked to comment on the nomination as a Certified Local Government prior to April 15, 2005, when the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board will consider the nomination.

The Registration Form described the significance of the General Hospital Nurses' Home under Criterion A for its association with advances in nurses' training and education and under Criterion C as a fine example of the work of Samuel Hannaford and Sons, a notable Cincinnati architectural firm.

Staff stated that the Registration Form clearly established the eligibility of the General Hospital Nurses' Home under Criterion A. The nurses' home and the administrators of the hospital's nursing program played a notable role in the development of a systematic field of academic/clinical study for nursing in Cincinnati and the nation. The nursing program, now the College of Nursing and Health, remains one of the foremost nursing schools in the United States. In addition, General Hospital Nurses' Home is one of two remaining nurses' homes connected to an historic hospital in Cincinnati. Bethesda Hospital remodeled its nurses' home for offices, but those at Good Samaritan, Christ, Jewish, and Childrens' Hospitals have been demolished.

While staff believed the nurses' home may well have merit under Criterion C as well for its association with Samuel Hannaford & Sons, the Nomination Form did not provide a compelling argument to draw such a conclusion. This, however, would not negate the building's eligibility for listing since a resource only needs to meet one Criterion to be listed in the National Register. The Board expressed concern that the extensive modification of interiors reduce its eligibility under Criterion C, but agreed that the resource was eligible for the Register for its historical significance.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Bloomfield, second by Raser) to take the following actions:

1. Find that the General Hospital Nurses' Home / Logan Hall, Central Clinic located at 311 Albert Sabin Way in Corryville meets the requirements of Criterion A for listing in the National Register of Historic Places;

2. Encourage the author to undertake additional research to strengthen the nomination and possibly establish the eligibility of the General Hospital Nurses' Home under Criterion C; and
3. Direct staff to forward the Board's findings regarding this nomination to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office prior to the April 15, 2005 meeting of the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board.

ADJOURN

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: _____